Closing Argument In Guilt Or Innocence

- Mr. Davis, you have 45 minutes.
- 20 MR. GREG DAVIS: Thank you, Judge.
- 21 May it please the Court?
- 22 THE COURT: Yes, sir.
- 23 MR. GREG DAVIS: Ladies and gentlemen,
- 24 before I begin, and I have 45 minutes, but you will be
- 25 relieved to know that I am going to be the last lawyer

Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

5321

- 1 talking to you today, and that probably does come as a 2 relief
- 3 But I want to also thank you, not for
- 4 serving because really you didn't have a choice about
- 5 that, but I do want to thank you for the very close
- 6 attention that you have shown throughout this four weeks.
- 7 In my 19 years, I don't recall a more
- 8 attentive jury. And there were times, as we talked about
- 9 in the opening statement, where unfortunately you had to
- 10 see things that really no juror should have to look at.
- 11 And you had to hear things that no juror should have to
- 12 hear. But I appreciate the attentiveness to the facts,
- 13 because it's on the facts that the truth is shown in this
- 14 case. Not on lawyers' statements. Lawyer talk here this
- 15 morning. But it's on the facts that you have heard here
- 16 over the last four weeks. That is what really counts in
- 17 this case.
- 18 Now, you have just heard three very
- 19 fine attorneys. Among the five that are over here at
- 20 this table, they are very fine attorneys. All. And you
- 21 have heard now, four very fine arguments from those three 22 attorneys.
- 23 I hope that there wasn't a one of you
- 24 sitting over there in the jury box that was surprised to
- 25 find out that none of these attorneys over here are
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5322
- 1 satisfied with the State's case.
- 2 In 19 years I have never seen it
- 3 happen. And I dare say, if I live to be a hundred, and
- 4 if I am still out here practicing law, I don't think I
- 5 will ever see it either. It just doesn't happen. If it
- 6 did, we wouldn't be here today, would we?
- 7 You know, Mr. Mulder would have you
- 8 believe, that there was some sort of conspiracy on the
- 9 part of the State of Texas here in this case to mislead
- 10 you good people.

- 11 Here is my answer to that: If there
- 12 is a one of you, when you go back there to that jury room
- 13 today, if there is even a one of you who believes that,
- 14 before you look at any of the evidence in this case, any
- 15 of the facts before you, if you believe that, you write
- 16 not guilty and you come back in here.
- 17 That is how strongly I feel about
- 18 that. There has been no effort at all to mislead you
- 19 good people. There has been an over-all effort here,
- 20 over this four week period here, from this side of the
- 21 table, any way, to try to show you the truth as best we
- 22 know how, and we have done that.
- 23 You know, if I was going to mislead
- 24 the people at this table over here as they claim, would
- 25 I, over three months ago now, have given them material Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5323
- 1 that might in some way help their client? Would I have
- 2 done that? You know the answer is no, I would not have
- 3 done that. I would have swept that under the rug, under
- 4 the carpet and said, "We don't need that stuff."
- 5 But, that is not the way we operate.
- 6 We hand it over, good or bad, and let them use it as they
- 7 see fit and that is what they have done in this case.
- 8 I'm not going to apologize for
- 9 standing up here and representing the good people of the
- 10 State of Texas and Dallas County. I'm not ashamed to be
- 11 sitting at this table. I'm not ashamed at all of the
- 12 good people from the Rowlett Police Department who are
- 13 still down here in this courtroom today.
- 14 You know, these are the men and women
- 15 who protect us. These are the men and women who, when
- 16 they got that call on June the 6th of '96, they are the
- 17 ones that we sent over there to 5801 Eagle Drive, aren't
- 18 they? And they had to walk into literally hell that
- 19 morning at 2:35 in the morning and start dealing with
- 20 that hell and start dealing with this woman right over
- 21 here, Darlie Lynn Routier.
- 22 They didn't ask to do that, you see
- 23 that is their job, and that is what they did in this
- 24 case, and they have got absolutely nothing to be ashamed
- 25 of and I am proud that they are a part of our case, and I
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5324
- 1 am proud that they are sitting in here where you can see
- 2 them this morning.
- 3 There is one other thing I am very
- 4 proud to do. I am very, very, proud most of all in this

- 5 case, to be the voices for Damon and Devon Routier. You
- 6 know the two little boys, we almost forget them. You
- 7 know, the pictures were put over here, I suppose after
- 8 Mr. Shook's argument. I don't think it takes a genius to
- 9 figure that out.
- 10 You know, these two little boys right
- 11 here don't have voices any more, do they? They are
- 12 dependent on us, Mr. Shook, Ms. Wallace and myself, and I
- 13 will guarantee you, I am going to use my voice this
- 14 morning to the best of my ability to talk for these two
- 15 little boys, who never had a chance as their mother
- 16 slaughtered them there on June the 6th, 1996.
- 17 May we never forget these two precious
- 18 children. May they always be a part of this case.
- 19 You know this case, I think, shows a
- 20 very distinct difference in good and bad. It shows you a
- 21 very distinct difference in what the guilty do and what
- 22 the innocent do.
- 23 It's been a textbook, almost on what
- 24 does a guilty woman do when she comes to trial in Kerr
- 25 County?
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5325
- 1 The first thing she does is, she tries
- 2 to deceive you. Mr. Mulder used that word, misleading,
- 3 misleading, misleading. If there is anybody in this
- 4 courtroom who has tried to mislead you throughout these
- 5 past four weeks, it's this woman over here.
- 6 Just like her husband, trying to
- 7 materially alter her appearance for you. She doesn't
- 8 want you to know who she really is. That is why she sits
- 9 over there like she is today with this plaintive little
- 10 look on her face, "Poor me, I am the victim," kind of
- 11 look. Hoping that just one of you, because it only takes
- 12 one of you, one of you will buy into that game.
- 13 And then what do they do beyond that?
- 14 Well, they blame the phantom intruder.
- 15 Mr. Mosty made mention of Charles
- 16 Manson out in California. I think what we saw by this
- 17 team over here, was what I am going to call the Susan
- 18 Smith defense. That phantom intruder. You know that
- 19 fellow -- remember, it was a black man in South Carolina,
- 20 supposedly, that took those two children.
- 21 It's that man that we just don't know
- 22 where he went to. We can't describe him. My goodness, I
- 23 don't know. It's the phantom. And you stay with that
- 24 phantom until all of the evidence in this case shows that
- 25 that is totally impossible and inconsistent with what

- 1 they found out there on Eagle Drive that day.
- 2 And I don't have to go over that, Mr.
- 3 Shook did a fine job of doing that this morning earlier.
- 4 But you stay with that until that one doesn't work. Then
- 5 what do you do? You go to Glenn Mize, and you point the
- 6 finger through those letters at poor Glenn Mize and you
- 7 say, "I know it's Glenn Mize." Not that: "The
- 8 investigators have told me that maybe it was Glenn Mize.
- 9 I know it's Glenn Mize." And you stick with that until
- 10 poor Glenn Mize has to trot into this courtroom and stand
- 11 before this accuser, and where she finally has to admit,
- 12 it can't possibly be Glenn Mize.
- 13 Then what do you do? You go to a man
- 14 named Gary Austin. And you say, "I guess maybe it's this
- 15 Gary Austin," you know, this guy that lives all the way
- 16 down the block, who can magically, I guess, look over the
- 17 horizon, into her backyard and watch her while she is in
- 18 this hot tub.
- 19 If that one doesn't work, then you go
- 20 to Angelia Rickels, and you say, "Well, it must have been
- 21 those two guys over there on Miami Drive that morning."
- 22 But, there's a couple of problems with
- 23 that. Angelia Rickels, you had a chance to see her. Did
- 24 you really believe that she can accurately recall what
- 25 happened to her that night? I mean, a man is supposedly Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5327
- 1 bumping on that doorknob for ten minutes solid and this
- 2 woman says she is alone, her husband is not there, and
- 3 she doesn't call the police.
- 4 Maybe that happened, and maybe it
- 5 didn't, but what you do know is this: That the
- 6 description of the two men that she saw there at her
- 7 house, don't in any way match the description that this
- 8 woman over here gave to the Rowlett Police Department,
- 9 does it?
- 10 Cowboy hat, cowboy shirt, long sleeved
- 11 for one of them. That is not the man that she described
- 12 out there on June 6th, or any other date.
- 13 Another man is wearing a toboggan with
- 14 a dark jogging suit, long sleeves, that is not the
- 15 description either, is it? So even if those men were
- 16 there, for whatever reason they were there, we can rest
- 17 assured that they are not the man that came into her home
- 18 that morning on June the 6th.
- 19 And, as a last resort then, what do

- 20 you do? You go for this man in the dark T-shirt and dark
- 21 cap that was talked to, not the morning of June the 6th,
- 22 but the afternoon of June the 6th, some 14 hours after
- 23 this thing happened.
- 24 And you see, it's kind of like that
- 25 Paul Harvey show. You didn't hear the rest of the story.
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5328
- 1 Mr. Mulder knows his name as I do. His name is Wilford
- 2 Davis.
- 3 And Mr. Mulder told you something that
- 4 wasn't true. Maybe inadvertently he did that. But he
- 5 said to you, we didn't get his fingerprints and match
- 6 them to the ones on that window out there on Eagle Drive.
- 7 And I'll stand before you right now, and I will tell you
- 8 that the State of Texas did, when we called --
- 10 MR. RICHARD C. MOSTY: That is outside
- 11 the record, your Honor.
- 12 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Judge, if they
- 13 did, they haven't told us.
- 14 MR. GREG DAVIS: That is not
- 15 exculpatory evidence.
- 16 THE COURT: Just a minute, gentlemen.
- 17 The jury is instructed to remember the
- 18 testimony as they heard it, and be guided by the Charge
- 19 of the Court, and both sides are reminded to stay within 20 the record.
- 21 MR. GREG DAVIS: Yes, sir.
- 22 As invited argument, I'm going to tell
- 23 you that is not true.
- 24 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: Judge --
- 25 MR. RICHARD C. MOSTY: That is an
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5329
- 1 absolute misstatement. We have -- there is no --
- 2 MR. DOUGLAS MULDER: No one has ever
- 3 told us --
- 4 MR. RICHARD C. MOSTY: There is no
- 5 evidence of that --
- 6 THE COURT: Just a minute, gentlemen.
- 7 One defense attorney at a time, please.
- 8 MR. RICHARD C. MOSTY: That is not in
- 9 the record anywhere anyhow.
- 10 THE COURT: Both sides are ordered to
- 11 stay within the record, and the jury is ordered to
- 12 remember the testimony as they heard it, and be guided by
- 13 the Charge of the Court.

- 14 Please continue.
- 15 MR. GREG DAVIS: Yes, sir.
- 16 And then, I guess finally, it is some
- 17 drug crazed maniac, I think that was Mr. Mosty's term,
- 18 -- you know, where is this drug crazed maniac, and where
- 19 does that idea come from?
- 20 If there is some drug crazed maniac
- 21 out there that is a suspect, then I want to know this:
- 22 Where are those investigators that were hired by the
- 23 defense to go out to that neighborhood?
- 24 And don't you know that if they had
- 25 found someone like that, there is no way in this world Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5330
- 1 that they wouldn't have been sitting on that witness
- 2 stand telling you people about the folks that they found
- 3 out there. But that is not what happened is it?
- 4 All right. Next one. When all of
- 5 that doesn't work, what you do is this: You blame the
- 6 police. I don't know of an older defense. It's the most
- 7 regularly used defense certainly. But you look at these
- 8 police officers and you say, they just didn't do the job
- 9 right. They either didn't do enough, or they did too
- 10 much. You kind of take your pick on most of these cases.
- 11 And you say to them, "You know, you put her in the cross
- 12 hairs immediately, and you weren't careful enough."
- 13 Ask yourselves this: If the Rowlett
- 14 police had gone out there on June the 6th and decided,
- 15 this is it, Darlie Routier is the one and only. We don't
- 16 care about anybody else, we're not going to look for
- 17 another suspect, this is our suspect right here and we're
- 18 going to make our case against her. You just wonder, I
- 19 guess somebody forgot to tell Charles Hamilton about that
- 20 that morning, didn't they?
- 21 I mean, here is poor old Charles
- 22 Hamilton out there for five hours trying to lift
- 23 fingerprints from that house. Now, why would they have
- 24 done that? Gone to that trouble of trying to find the
- 25 fingerprints of that intruder if they had already decided
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5331
- 1 this is our one and only suspect? And why would they
- 2 wait for James Cron? Why not just go ahead and get in
- 3 that house, and go through there and say it all matches
- 4 Darlie Routier?
- 5 They didn't do that though, did they?
- 6 They waited until a man with 39 years experience in crime
- 7 scene search went out there and assisted them. Why would

- 8 you call for Charlie Linch and Kathryn Long from SWIFS if
- 9 you already know who you want to charge over here? Why
- 10 go to the trouble of finding the blood evidence? Why go
- 11 to the trouble of having over a hundred blood samples DNA
- 12 tested, like we did in this case?
- 13 Why do you do all of those things, if
- 14 you have already made up your mind that this is our
- 15 suspect? You don't do that. You do that because you
- 16 want to know the truth, the most complete truth possible,
- 17 and that is exactly what they did and that is exactly
- 18 what we did in this case right here.
- 19 The next person that you blame, must
- 20 be the medical community. You say, the nurses -- you
- 21 don't remember what you remember, about what she told you
- 22 out there that day. And when it comes to the bruising,
- 23 you six skilled nurses and you doctors don't know what
- 24 you were doing out there, you missed this obvious bruise
- 25 out here. You were negligent in your duties toward this
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5332

1 woman.

- 2 You know, it's interesting, I watched
- 3 Mr. Mulder while he showed where that bruise was in that
- 4 polaroid. Did you notice the arm? Did Mr. Mulder point
- 5 here to the inside of the arm? No, he didn't, did he?
- 6 He pointed on the outside, where that wound was, where
- 7 you would expect to see a redness on June the 6th. Not
- 8 over here on the inside of the arm where that bruise
- 9 shows up on June the 10th of 1996, did he?
- 10 And then to buttress your case against
- 11 the nursing profession out there, what do you do? You
- 12 bring in family and friends who might as well have been
- 13 sitting on the front row of this gallery throughout the
- 14 case, they know as much about this case as you do as
- 15 jurors.
- 16 And after all of the evidence is in
- 17 from the State, they all get up here, with a very clear
- 18 memory apparently, with no photographs to back them up,
- 19 because you see it wasn't important back then.
- 20 They all tell you, "Oh sure, I know
- 21 that bruise was there all the way from here up to there."
- 22 Except for one, it was curious, Karen Neal. Of all of
- 23 them that came in here, who is the registered nurse of
- 24 the lot? It was Karen Neal. And what did Karen Neal
- 25 tell you about that bruise? Do you remember?
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5333

- 1 When Mr. Shook asked her about the
- 2 location, she didn't point to the inside of the arm where
- 3 the family and friends had pointed to. I was watching
- 4 her very closely, as I hope you were also.
- 5 She went right to that outside, didn't
- 6 she? Right to where you would expect the wound to be.
- 7 Not to where the others said they saw that bruising, and
- 8 she is the registered nurse, just like the others from
- 9 Baylor Hospital, who know what they saw and know what
- 10 they didn't see. There was no bruise at Baylor Hospital.
- 11 Who do you blame next? You blame
- 12 James Cron. What you do, you call him that old bearded
- 13 man who came out there. You call him a fingerprint man.
- 14 Even though you know he is a senior crime scene analyst.
- 15 I mean, that is what the man does. And you say, he just
- 16 waltzed through that house, and he came up with this
- 17 conclusion like that.
- 18 Folks, it wasn't rocket science that
- 19 we were dealing with out there. A man with 39 years
- 20 experience walked through that house, and it just stuck
- 21 out like a sore thumb.
- 22 Her story doesn't match the evidence.
- 23 And now, you have had the opportunity to see what he did
- 24 and you can see why he walked through there and said, "It
- 25 doesn't match up. We need to look at some things. You Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter

- 1 people know what you are doing, let's do the testing,
- 2 let's do the printing, let's do all of this stuff, but I
- 3 am telling you right now, from what I know and from what
- 4 I see, it doesn't match up."
- 5 And he was the starting point in this
- 6 case. He was not the finishing touch, he was the
- 7 starting point. And then what do they do? After they
- 8 blame Cron, they come in here against Charlie Linch and
- 9 they say Charlie Linch gave -- I think the quote from Mr.
- 10 Mosty was -- he gave you a bunch of unfounded opinions.
- 11 I think unfounded opinions are opinions that they don't
- 12 like. I think that is the definition that we can
- 13 conclude unfounded opinions are.
- 14 What did Charlie Linch tell you? He
- 15 told you that he found that fiberglass rod, and he found
- 16 that rubbery material on that knife. Up to that time, he
- 17 had never seen a compound before, under the microscope,
- 18 like the rubber compound that he found on that knife that
- 19 just happened to come out of the butcher block, out of
- 20 whose kitchen? This woman's kitchen. Never seen that.
- 21 What did he see when he looked at that
- 22 window screen? What did he see right here? He saw the

- 23 same two things. He saw fiberglass, and he saw this
- 24 rubbery material that he had never seen before.
- 25 And there was one more thing that he

- 1 saw there that the defense just didn't mention during the
- 2 arguments. He saw embedded in that rubbery material,
- 3 fragments of glass. Fiberglass that were wed to the
- 4 rubber material, and from that, he told you that he could
- 5 conclude scientifically, that the rubbery material, and
- 6 the fiberglass in it were placed on that knife blade at
- 7 the same time.
- 8 Now, we know that Charlie Linch was
- 9 right about one thing in this case: He was right about
- 10 that sock, wasn't he?
- 11 When he told you those fibers were
- 12 consistent with that shoe. Darin Routier's shoe. Was
- 13 Charlie Linch right or was Charlie Linch wrong?
- 14 We know he was right, because Darin
- 15 Routier, thanks to Corrine Wells, had to get up here and 16 tell you.
- 17 MR. JOHN HAGLER: Excuse me, your
- 18 Honor, I believe he is going into something that is not
- 19 in evidence.
- 20 THE COURT: The jury is instructed to
- 21 remember the testimony and evidence you have heard, and
- 22 both sides are instructed to remain within the record.
- 23 MR. GREG DAVIS: Yes, sir.
- 24 MR. JOHN HAGLER: Could we have a
- 25 ruling on that, your Honor?

- 1 THE COURT: Well, I'll overrule that.
- 2 MR. JOHN HAGLER: He is going to go
- 3 into a matter that is not in evidence.
- 4 MR. GREG DAVIS: No, sir, I am not.
- 5 THE COURT: No, he is not, I don't
- 6 think he is. If he does, then the objection will be 7 sustained.
- 8 MR. GREG DAVIS: Yes, sir.
- 9 THE COURT: Stay within the record.
- 10 MR. GREG DAVIS: And what did Darin
- 11 Routier say to you good people, he said, "That is my sock
- 12 and it came out of that utility room. It's my sock."
- 13 Just like Charlie Linch had told you after his
- 14 microscopic examinations.
- 15 Now, let's talk about the sock for
- 16 just a second here before I go on. You know, I'm not

- 17 telling you that this defendant went down there in some
- 18 clever effort to plant this sock. I'm not saying that.
- 19 Mr. Shook is not saying that either. What we are saying
- 20 to you is, that this woman knew very well that this sock
- 21 right here came out of her house.
- 22 She knew good and well that she was
- 23 going to get it out of that house and try to disassociate
- 24 it from that house. You see, she never counted on that
- 25 knife being found in that butcher block with that
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5337
- 1 fiberglass.
- 2 But she knew that that sock right
- 3 there had blood on it, and how is she going to ever
- 4 explain that? Get it out of the house. It wouldn't take
- 5 her very long at all, and that is exactly what she did in
- 6 this case. And the telltale thing is the blood that is
- 7 on there. Whose blood is on the sock? Is it the blood
- 8 that we would expect to see from some intruder who came
- 9 over there and stuffed it down her mouth, attacked her,
- 10 stabbed her, slashed her throat? Is it her blood? No.
- 11 it's not. It's only the two boys and about a
- 12 nickel-sized stain. Not her blood.
- 13 You know, the next man to attack was
- 14 Tom Bevel. Well, let me back up to Charlie Linch one
- 15 more time here.
- 16 You know, we know as they criticized
- 17 Charlie Linch, we know that back in August of last year,
- 18 that there was an expert by the name of Bart Epstein, a
- 19 trace evidence analyst there at SWIFS on behalf of the
- 20 defendant. And we know that back there in August that
- 21 Charlie Linch said, "Here, I will show you everything
- 22 that I am doing out here." He let him look at the
- 23 slides, let him examine the evidence.
- 24 Basically, he looked over Charlie
- 25 Linch's shoulder and graded his work out there at SWIFS.
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5338
- 1 And don't you know, don't you know, that if Bart Epstein
- 2 had any disagreement whatsoever with the findings of
- 3 Charles Linch, that you would have seen him up here on
- 4 this witness stand? Because we know that this defense
- 5 team here, when they need a witness like Richard Coons,
- 6 hey, you can place a phone call at 9:00 P.M. and they
- 7 will get him here the next morning.
- 8 So where is Bart Epstein? You know
- 9 why he is not here, because there is nothing wrong with
- 10 Charles Linch's work in this case.

- 11 As we look to Tom Bevel, as they
- 12 criticized Tom Bevel on his opinions. That videotape,
- 13 and you have got the T-shirts back here, as you look at
- 14 that videotape with that motion demonstrated by Tom Bevel
- 15 and you will find that they weren't long on the back.
- 16 Those blood stains. They are the same size and
- 17 consistent with the size of Devon Routier's blood that
- 18 was deposited on the back of this defendant's shirt.
- 19 That is what the videotape and the T-shirt will show you.
- 20 Mr. Mosty demonstrated about picking
- 21 up this vacuum cleaner. Listen, it's not that hard, and
- 22 you can try it yourself. You don't have to hold it down
- 23 here by the neck. If you hold it right up here and you
- 24 roll it around, as this defendant did that day, what do
- 25 you get? You look at my hand and you will see, you get

- 1 the blood smear right on the right side of this handle,
- 2 exactly like she did that day.
- 3 You know, here is the bottom line on
- 4 Tom Bevel. You know out there at SWIFS there is another
- 5 expert, Terry Labor. He is the DNA blood spatter expert
- 6 who went out there on behalf of the defendant also, along
- 7 with Bart Epstein. And if they want to quarrel with Tom
- 8 Bevel and tell you that he is wrong, and that he is a
- 9 witch doctor of some sort, where is Terry Labor then?
- 10 Where is their blood spatter expert?
- 11 Don't you know that if he had any
- 12 criticism of the opinions rendered by Tom Bevel, that
- 13 just like Bart Epstein, you would see them right up here,
- 14 and he would be detailing for you what those criticisms
- 15 are. But he is not here either, is he? And for a very
- 16 good reason.
- 17 There is one other thing that we need
- 18 to ask also. Where are the samples from the T-shirt
- 19 taken by Terry Labor? Where are they? You remember
- 20 those first dibs samples that Terry Labor took from the
- 21 defendant's T-shirt back in August? Before Tom Bevel
- 22 even had a chance to look at the T-shirt. Terry Labor,
- 23 the defendant's expert, went to Dallas and was given an
- 24 opportunity to take several samples from that T-shirt.
- 25 Did you see those samples in this
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5340
- 1 courtroom at any point in this trial? No, you didn't.
- 2 Don't you wonder why? You really
- 3 don't have to wonder long about that question. It's
- 4 obvious to you. Why those best samples taken by the

- 5 defense, why you never saw them, and why you never heard
- 6 a test result or a DNA result on any of the samples.
- 7 It speaks volumes to you sometimes
- 8 what you don't see and hear. And it speaks volumes in
- 9 this case with regards that T-shirt.
- 10 Well, after you have beat up on the
- 11 police and you beat up on the nurses, the forensic
- 12 experts, next to last you try to change your story.
- 13 You see, you can still win this case
- 14 if you are the defendant, if you can change the facts.
- 15 And if you can go back and say, "By the way, you know, I
- 16 remember my wife, she was right over there with me doing
- 17 that CPR on Devon, even though I have never said it to
- 18 anybody before. Yeah, she was over there at that sink.
- 19 Now that I know that the sink has been cleaned up and
- 20 there is traces of blood, by golly, I just happened to
- 21 remember that she was over by that sink."
- 22 And then when her blood is found on
- 23 the vacuum cleaner, the DNA results come back, you say:
- 24 "Well, by golly, I guess that just slipped my mind too.
- 25 My wife was over there using that as a cane or a crutch."
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5341
- 1 Then, if you are the defendant, you do
- 2 the very same thing. All of a sudden, through this
- 3 traumatic amnesia, you remember the Devon CPR, you
- 4 remember the sink, you remember the vacuum cleaner. You
- 5 remember the bruises on your arm, and then even you
- 6 remember that you didn't wear panties that night, or they
- 7 were taken from you.
- 8 So if you change enough facts, folks.
- 9 I mean, nobody is ever guilty if you can do that.
- 10 And when that one failed, as it did in
- 11 this case, what is the last thing that you do? What you
- 12 do is you say, traumatic amnesia.
- 13 You know, I think it would be fair to
- 14 term that the "I can't remember" or "I won't remember"
- 15 defense. It's just like Mr. Shook talked about with some
- 16 of these doctors, you know if you say "I don't remember."
- 17 How do you get at that? I mean, if I told you people, "I
- 18 don't remember something," is there any number of
- 19 questions that you could ask to make me remember
- 20 something like that?
- 21 It's convenient, isn't it? It's very
- 22 convenient in this case. And in order to try to prove
- 23 that defense, they bring Dr. Lisa Clayton, and I have got
- 24 no quarrel with her. But it really seems strange to me,
- 25 that when Mr. Mulder said that she had freedom to do

- 1 whatever she wanted on this case, it just strikes me as
- 2 just a little bit funny the very limited number of things
- 3 that she chose to do.
- 4 Who does she talk to? Well, she talks
- 5 to the defendant quite a bit for 12 hours. You know she
- 6 is a real objective source of information, don't you?
- 7 She talks to her husband. You have all had a chance to
- 8 see Darin Routier. Need I say more? Okay.
- 9 The family, her in-laws, kind of a
- 10 one-sided picture that we're getting here, put that is
- 11 the picture that Lisa Clayton chose to see.
- 12 No paramedics, no police officers, no
- 13 nurses, no doctors, no one outside of the immediate
- 14 family of Darlie Routier. And then she comes to this
- 15 startling conclusion that she thinks that Darlie Routier
- 16 is telling her the truth. You know?
- 17 I mean, it's a bit mind-boggling that
- 18 she would do that. But then again, this is the doctor,
- 19 the psychiatrist who would have you and I believe, that
- 20 there is nothing inappropriate, eight days after your
- 21 children have been slaughtered, to go out to their
- 22 graves, and shoot some Silly String and laugh and carry 23 on.
- 24 You see, when we look at that tape,
- 25 according to Dr. Clayton, and our stomach turns a little Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5343
- 1 bit, because we still have consciences and those things
- 2 bother us. It's our fault, don't you understand, because
- 3 we don't know what is appropriate and not appropriate.
- 4 That is Dr. Clayton's take on this case.
- 5 And then, I guess maybe she doesn't do
- 6 a good enough job, and so Richard Coons is called in. I
- 7 guess coincidences happen in life, but this one seems a
- 8 bit farfetched that he calls at 9:00 o'clock on
- 9 Wednesday, what, about four hours after the defendant 10 testifies in this case.
- 11 I can imagine that call going out, "Is
- 12 there a doctor in the house, the defendant has mortally
- 13 wounded her case, and we need a doctor down here now."
- 14 And so, Richard Coons comes to
- 15 Kerrville. And I have got no quarrel with him, believe
- 16 me. He is an eminently qualified psychiatrist and a fine
- 17 gentlemen, and I think he told you the truth, as he sat
- 18 on that stand.
- 19 There is only one problem with Dr.

- 20 Coons though. They didn't give him any facts, did they?
- 21 Oh, they gave him a lot of hypothetical questions from
- 22 Mr. Douglass here. A lot of assumptions that were all
- 23 favorable to the defendant, and then he answers the
- 24 questions.
- 25 But you see what happens when you
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5344
- 1 change those a little bit, as Mr. Shook did, and you
- 2 start talking about some of the facts, the actual true
- 3 facts in the case, his opinion started to change, didn't
- 4 it? And I think it's very clear why they chose as they
- 5 did, because that is their witness. It's very evident
- 6 why they chose not to give him any facts at all to work
- 7 with. Because they knew, as you do, that if you give
- 8 that man -- because he is honest, if you give him the
- 9 facts, he may give you an answer that you don't like.
- 10 MR. RICHARD C. MOSTY: Your Honor, I'm
- 11 going to object to that. He was called as a rebuttal
- 12 witness. He could only rebut, he can only be called to
- 13 rebut what the State has put on. That is the only
- 14 purpose that he can be called for.
- 15 THE COURT: Thank you. The jury is
- 16 instructed to remember the testimony as they heard it,
- 17 and be guided by the Charge of the Court. You have 15
- 18 minutes left.
- 19 MR. GREG DAVIS: Thank you, Judge.
- 20 Well, I told you what a guilty woman
- 21 does and very quickly, as we walk through here, let's
- 22 talk about what an innocent woman does and doesn't do.
- 23 You ask yourselves these questions, as
- 24 I go through here, using the common sense test, and
- 25 really that is your best thing to hang on to. You have Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter
- 5345
- 1 heard a lot, hang on to your common sense. But as I go
- 2 through here very quickly,
- 3 Does an innocent woman, a light
- 4 sleeping innocent woman, does she sleep through the
- 5 stabbing of a child that is five feet away from her?
- 6 No, she doesn't.
- 7 Does an innocent woman sleep through
- 8 the stabbing of her child as he is one foot away from 9 her?
- 10 No, she doesn't.
- 11 What do innocent women do? They come
- 12 to the defense of their children, is what they do.
- 13 And does an innocent woman then sleep

- 14 through her own attack. Puncture wound to the arm,
- 15 slashes to the neck, stab to the left shoulder. Does an
- 16 innocent woman sleep through her own attack?
- 17 You know, I don't even have to answer
- 18 that one. Your common sense gives you the answer.
- 19 Absolutely not.
- 20 But in all three cases, this is what
- 21 this woman claims to have done, and she did it because
- 22 she is not an innocent woman.
- 23 When she wakes up, does an innocent
- 24 woman look up and see an intruder and not immediately
- 25 yell upstairs for her husband? No.
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5346
- 1 And does an innocent woman wake up,
- 2 see her children here bleeding, and then leave them and
- 3 chase into a darkened kitchen and utility room, after an
- 4 armed intruder? No.
- 5 But that is not what this woman did;
- 6 is it? What she did is not consistent with what an
- 7 innocent woman does. And, does an innocent woman, while
- 8 her children are literally bleeding at her feet, look
- 9 around the room, and make sure that none of her jewelry 10 is gone?
- 11 Heaven help us if that is what
- 12 innocent women and mothers do, and that is what parents
- 13 do. No. They don't do it, but that is exactly what she
- 14 did that morning. Looking around to make sure the
- 15 goodies aren't gone from that kitchen bar.
- 16 And do innocent women, innocent
- 17 mothers, again, as their children are bleeding, do they
- 18 worry about leaving fingerprints on a knife handle? Of
- 19 course not. But that is exactly what this woman did
- 20 because she is not an innocent woman.
- 21 And do innocent women have to give
- 22 eight accounts of what happened? All different accounts?
- 23 I'm not going to run through all of
- 24 them. But basically, to Waddell, the fight was at the
- 25 kitchen bar. To Walling, the fight was at the couch. To
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5347
- 1 Jody Cotner, Damon shook her and woke her up and followed
- 2 her in the kitchen.
- 3 To Dianne Hollon, there is an intruder
- 4 over her immediately, and she felt pressure and there is
- 5 a fight at the couch.
- 6 To Paige Campbell, the intruder is
- 7 over her, and he tried to stab her. She grabbed at the

- 8 knife. She never saw his face.
- 9 To Denise Faulk, Damon was crying to
- 10 wake her. Struggle at the neck. Wrestling on the couch.
- 11 Barbara Jovell, Damon woke her by
- 12 saying "Mommy, Mommy," and pressure on the legs. And in
- 13 her voluntary statement she just says a man is walking
- 14 away from her.
- 15 Listen, folks, if you are telling the
- 16 truth it doesn't take eight shots at it to get it.
- 17 Because the truth never changes. Once is enough. But
- 18 that is not what this woman did, because this woman right
- 19 here is not an innocent woman. This woman here is guilty
- 20 of capital murder.
- 21 And does an innocent woman, can you
- 22 imagine, in your wildest nightmares, an innocent mother
- 23 sitting across the table from Bill Parker, and having
- 24 Bill Parker accuse her of killing her own flesh and blood
- 25 several times, and remaining polite for a three hour
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5348
- 1 period.
- 2 Or never denying the fact that she
- 3 killed her children, and can you imagine an innocent
- 4 mother sitting across the table from Bill Parker and he
- 5 says, "I know you killed your children." And an innocent
- 6 mother just saying: "Hum." (Shrugging shoulders.)
- 7 No, they don't. That is not what she
- 8 did, you see, because this woman right here is not an
- 9 innocent woman. Guilty of capital murder, Darlie
- 10 Routier.
- 11 You know you have got a very simple
- 12 choice here. You have got a choice of either this woman
- 13 sitting over here, Darlie Lynn Routier, killed her two
- 14 children, or some mysterious, lucky intruder did it. And
- 15 he, indeed, has to be a lucky intruder, doesn't he?
- 16 Happened to pick the night that the
- 17 window is open. Happens to pick the night where a sock
- 18 is left conveniently in a utility room. We haven't even
- 19 mentioned how he got in.
- 20 I guess the guy just had to slip down
- 21 the chimney, to get the knife, then go out and then cut
- 22 the screen, and then come through the utility room. But
- 23 when he got in there, lucky fellow, the knife is in the
- 24 butcher block. Lucky fellow that he kills two children
- 25 without the mother waking. Lucky fellow that when he
- Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5349

- 1 cuts this woman over here, she can't describe him.
- 2 Lucky fellow that he drops a knife on
- 3 the floor as he leaves, arming his victim, and she
- 4 doesn't pick it up and wound him. Lucky fellow that he
- 5 leaves no trace in the garage. Lucky fellow that he
- 6 leaves no trace in the backyard as he leaves.
- 7 Those are your choices here. And as
- 8 you go through here, and as you look at the hard,
- 9 scientific, physical evidence, as Mr. Mosty asked you to,
- 10 and I will also. When you look at that screen being cut
- 11 by that knife inside the house, as it was, that is really
- 12 as far as you have to go with the hard, scientific stuff.
- 13 Because, if that fact is true, that that screen on that
- 14 window was cut with a knife inside of that kitchen of the
- 15 defendant, that answers all of the questions that you
- 16 have in this case right here that you need to answer.
- 17 Now you know from the scientific
- 18 evidence that was the case. And as you look at Devon's
- 19 blood on the back of that T-shirt, you know how that was
- 20 deposited. And as you look at the boys' blood on the
- 21 front of the T-shirt, you know how that was transported
- 22 to her T-shirt.
- 23 As you look at that utility room
- 24 floor, you know that the floor is totally inconsistent
- 25 with the story that she gave. There is no cast off Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5350
- 1 pattern, and you know from the scientific evidence that
- 2 that was the case.
- 3 The blood on the vacuum, the roll
- 4 marks that she made in the kitchen as she staged that
- 5 scene. And the sink being cleaned with the blood hidden
- 6 behind the closed drawers and doors to that sink.
- 7 The physical evidence is there. It
- 8 points not at many people, not at some people, but it
- 9 points very clearly to this woman right here, Darlie Lynn
- 10 Routier. And only Darlie Lynn Routier.
- 11 You know she did it, and they keep
- 12 saying that I didn't show you why they did it, and I
- 13 think I did. We have got a pretty good snapshot look at
- 14 what this woman's life was like back then.
- 15 It's so desperate that on May 3rd of
- 16 1996, in this beautifully normal American home, with no
- 17 problems in it, this woman is contemplating suicide. You
- 18 know it wasn't good in there. You know the pressures
- 19 were building up with the children. You know she was
- 20 unhappy that she hadn't had a girl. She was unhappy with
- 21 her weight and with her appearance. She is unhappy that
- 22 she is not getting the attention from her husband that

- 23 she wants to get out there, and she is unhappy about that
- 24 financial situation.
- 25 Those numbers don't lie there. You

- 1 can see that if you average it out these people are going
- 2 to take in ninety thousand dollars less than they took in 3 in '95.
- 4 That is not bad money but when you are
- 5 used to 260, 170 is not going to cut it. You know the
- 6 pressure was there. You know why she did it. You have a
- 7 very good idea.
- 8 Only God and she knows exactly why she
- 9 did it. But we have a pretty darn good idea, don't we,
- 10 of the kind of pressure that was building up that night
- 11 on June 6th of 1996.
- 12 You know, these two children here,
- 13 well, they lived in Rowlett and I never had the pleasure
- 14 of meeting them, but you know, once upon a time they were
- 15 ours too. They weren't just Darlie Routier's children,
- 16 they were ours.
- 17 You see, they were our neighborhood
- 18 kids too. The kids we saw running up and down the
- 19 streets on their bicycles. They were our classmates.
- 20 They were our students. These children right here.
- 21 In a real sense they were our future.
- 22 You know, and as these two precious children, laid on
- 23 that carpet, looking up with those opened eyes, literally
- 24 drowning in their own blood as they laid on that carpet,
- 25 as Mr. Shook said to you, the very last thing that each Sandra M. Halsey, CSR, Official Court Reporter 5352
- 1 of these two children saw was their killer.
- 2 Can you imagine what it must have been
- 3 like for those two children that morning as they saw this
- 4 woman right here?
- 5 THE DEFENDANT: Liar, liar.
- 6 MR. GREG DAVIS: She says liar now --
- 7 THE DEFENDANT: You are a liar.
- 8 MR. GREG DAVIS: See. See. But --
- 9 THE DEFENDANT: I did not kill my
- 10 kids.
- 11 MR. GREG DAVIS: But they looked up
- 12 there, and they saw this woman right here, in a rage,
- 13 coming down on them with that knife, and that is the very
- 14 last thing that they saw. They saw their killer, and
- 15 after these four weeks, you have seen her too. Her name
- 16 is Darlie Lynn Routier. She sits here before you. And

- 17 I'll ask you now to go back to that commitment that you
- 18 all gave to us.
- 19 You said that if we proved our case
- 20 beyond a reasonable doubt, as we have in this case, that
- 21 not only could you, but you would, find this woman guilty 22 of capital murder, and that is exactly what I am going to
- 23 ask you to do at this time, because the facts in this
- 24 case show her to be guilty of capital murder.